



Cambridge International AS & A Level

THINKING SKILLS

9694/21

Paper 2 Critical Thinking

October/November 2020

MARK SCHEME

Maximum Mark: 50

Published

This mark scheme is published as an aid to teachers and candidates, to indicate the requirements of the examination. It shows the basis on which Examiners were instructed to award marks. It does not indicate the details of the discussions that took place at an Examiners' meeting before marking began, which would have considered the acceptability of alternative answers.

Mark schemes should be read in conjunction with the question paper and the Principal Examiner Report for Teachers.

Cambridge International will not enter into discussions about these mark schemes.

Cambridge International is publishing the mark schemes for the October/November 2020 series for most Cambridge IGCSE™, Cambridge International A and AS Level and Cambridge Pre-U components, and some Cambridge O Level components.

This document consists of **9** printed pages.

Generic Marking Principles

These general marking principles must be applied by all examiners when marking candidate answers. They should be applied alongside the specific content of the mark scheme or generic level descriptors for a question. Each question paper and mark scheme will also comply with these marking principles.

GENERIC MARKING PRINCIPLE 1:

Marks must be awarded in line with:

- the specific content of the mark scheme or the generic level descriptors for the question
- the specific skills defined in the mark scheme or in the generic level descriptors for the question
- the standard of response required by a candidate as exemplified by the standardisation scripts.

GENERIC MARKING PRINCIPLE 2:

Marks awarded are always **whole marks** (not half marks, or other fractions).

GENERIC MARKING PRINCIPLE 3:

Marks must be awarded **positively**:

- marks are awarded for correct/valid answers, as defined in the mark scheme. However, credit is given for valid answers which go beyond the scope of the syllabus and mark scheme, referring to your Team Leader as appropriate
- marks are awarded when candidates clearly demonstrate what they know and can do
- marks are not deducted for errors
- marks are not deducted for omissions
- answers should only be judged on the quality of spelling, punctuation and grammar when these features are specifically assessed by the question as indicated by the mark scheme. The meaning, however, should be unambiguous.

GENERIC MARKING PRINCIPLE 4:

Rules must be applied consistently, e.g. in situations where candidates have not followed instructions or in the application of generic level descriptors.

GENERIC MARKING PRINCIPLE 5:

Marks should be awarded using the full range of marks defined in the mark scheme for the question (however; the use of the full mark range may be limited according to the quality of the candidate responses seen).

GENERIC MARKING PRINCIPLE 6:

Marks awarded are based solely on the requirements as defined in the mark scheme. Marks should not be awarded with grade thresholds or grade descriptors in mind.

Annotations

	In Questions 1, 3 and 4 use to indicate where marks have been awarded. In questions where responses are undeveloped or developed (as defined within the scheme), use 1 tick for undeveloped and 2 ticks for developed.
	Use to indicate an element of an answer that looks as though it should be credited but is in fact wrong.
	In Questions 2 and 5 use to indicate 'conclusion'. Use twice to indicate nuanced conclusion in Question 2.
	In Questions 2 and 5 use to indicate creditworthy intermediate conclusion.
	In Questions 2 and 5 use to indicate creditworthy appropriate argument element.
	In Question 2 use to indicate creditworthy inferential reasoning. In Question 5 use to indicate creditworthy reason used to support a conclusion.
	In Question 2 use to indicate creditworthy use of source.
	In Question 2 use to indicate creditworthy evaluation of source.
	In Question 2 use to indicate creditworthy personal thinking.
	In appropriate cases, use to indicate significant omission.
	Not good enough.
	Benefit of doubt.
	Use in answers when no other annotations have been used. Use on blank pages. In appropriate cases, use to indicate answers which appear as if they might deserve credit but are incorrect or irrelevant.
Highlight	Use to indicate answers which are not being considered. Where helpful, use to identify the part of the answer to which another stamp pertains.

Question	Answer	Marks
1(a)	2 marks for a correct answer with accurate explanation 1 mark for a correct answer with vague, incomplete or generic explanation 0 marks for correct answer without explanation 0 marks for incorrect answer with or without explanation 2-mark answer Source B is an argument. The conclusion (<i>accept claim</i>) is the final sentence, supported by the previous sentence. (The earlier part of the source is a statement of the context.) 1-mark answers Source B is an argument, because it consists of a persuasive conclusion supported by reasoning. Source B is an argument. The conclusion (<i>accept claim</i>) is the final sentence.	2
1(b)	The usefulness is reduced by being suggested a long time after the events (poor ability to see) [1], but it is based on study of original documents (good ability to see) [1]. As 'a historical novelist', Trow might have some expertise [1] but it is likely to be limited [1]. Trow's book offers a (plausible) (alternative) hypothesis as to how Marlowe died [1]. The fact that this theory contradicts official records reduces its plausibility [1]. Source C offers a motive for Marlowe to be murdered [1], and some evidence to support it [1], but does not offer any proof [1]. No judgement mark.	3
1(c)	Not at all [1], because the question mark was put there by a group of people many of whom believed that his death was faked [1].	2
1(d)	Badly [1]. The fact that 'various' hypotheses about alternative authors have been proposed shows that there are real problems with Shakespeare's authorship [1]. The phrase 'mysteriously survived his own death' begs the question/relies on the assumption that Marlowe really did die in 1593 [1]; if the theory in Source D is true, Marlowe's survival is not 'mysterious' [1]. The coincidence of dates (Marlowe's 'death' and the publication of Shakespeare's first work) weakens the claim in Source E [1]. The theory put forward in Source D does not rely on coincidences, as Source E claims [1]. The claim about genius knowing 'no boundaries of social class or education' does not adequately answer the observation that Shakespeare's plays seem to have been written by someone of greater education than Shakespeare himself [1].	4
1(e)	Reliable to some extent (neither reliable nor unreliable) [1]. The retired teacher has some ability to see, because he has studied plays by Shakespeare, Marlowe and other 16th century dramatists [1], but the ability to see is limited, because he studied them many years ago [1] and his comment refers to only 'the authors we studied' [1]. He has some expertise, because he studied 16th century English Literature at university [1], but that expertise is limited, because he was only a first year undergraduate at the time [1]. Maximum 2 marks if only one side stated.	3

Question	Answer		Marks
2	Use of sources	2 marks: accurate use of at least 4 of the sources provided 1 mark: accurate use of 1–3 of the sources provided 0 marks: no accurate use of sources	8
	Evaluation of sources and/or inferential reasoning from sources	Up to 2 marks for evaluation of sources Up to 2 marks for inferential reasoning <i>These marks can be combined to a maximum of 3</i>	
	Supported conclusion	2 marks: nuanced (e.g. balanced or qualified) supported conclusion 1 mark: simple supported conclusion 0 marks: conclusion unstated or unsupported	
	Argument elements	Up to 2 marks for use of intermediate conclusion and/or other argument elements Up to 2 marks for personal thinking <i>These marks can be combined to a maximum of 3</i>	
	Indicative content • Source A states the generally accepted theory, but does not evaluate it. • Source B records the official verdict, which has good reliability; it strongly supports the claim. • Source C suggests an alternative to the claim and explains a plausible motivation for this to be true. • Source D suggests a different alternative, which could also be supported by the reasons given in Source C. • Source D states background evidence in support of its hypothesis. • Source E firmly rejects the hypothesis from Source D, but does not decide between the alternatives; however, Source E is unconvincing. • Source F gives some further support for the hypothesis in Source D.		

Question	Answer	Marks
2	Annotate answers as follows: C To indicate 'conclusion'. Use twice to indicate nuanced conclusion. S To indicate creditworthy use of source. EVAL To indicate creditworthy evaluation of source. R To indicate creditworthy inferential reasoning. P To indicate creditworthy personal thinking. I To indicate creditworthy intermediate conclusion. AE To indicate creditworthy appropriate argument element.	

Question	Answer	Marks
3(a)	<i>2 marks for an exact answer</i> <i>1 mark for a paraphrase, or for one additional element or omission</i> Wealthy, developed countries should (therefore) introduce a system of UBI for their citizens	2
3(b)	<i>For up to 3 of the following:</i> <i>2 marks for an exact answer</i> <i>1 mark for a paraphrase, or for one additional element or omission</i> - it is no longer realistic to expect everyone to work for their living. - UBI shares out fairly the benefits of technological advances. - The scheme is affordable - The biggest benefit of UBI is that it improves family life. - The introduction of UBI enhances the quality of individual and community life. - UBI helps the poorest members of society. <i>If more than three answers are offered, mark the first four only.</i>	6
3(c)	<i>2 marks: counter assertion (accept counter-claim).</i> <i>OR accurate description of counter-assertion without naming it.</i> <i>1 mark: counter (argument)</i>	2
3(d)	<i>2 marks for an exact version of the following</i> <i>1 mark for an incomplete or vague version of the following</i> - Enough people will choose to undertake employment / enough paid work will be available for the tax on their income to be sufficient to fund the payment of UBI. <i>1 mark for marginal assumption, for example</i> - People will choose not to work if (they think that) taxes are too high.	2

Question	Answer	Marks
4(a)	<i>2 marks each for an exact version of up to 2 of the following: 1 mark each for an incomplete or vague version of up to 2 of the following: 1 mark each for up to 2 of the following presented as a challenge instead of a weakness:</i> • <i>Weak support</i> – The reasoning supports the claim that UBI improves family life, but not that this is its biggest advantage (because no others are mentioned). • <i>Reliance on questionable assumption</i> – that many parents are currently unable to spend as much time with their children as they need/would wish to. • <i>Reliance on questionable assumption</i> – that many parents will choose to spend more time with their children than they do at present. • <i>Reliance on questionable assumption</i> – that a reduced standard of living would not cause net harm to teenagers' mental health. • <i>Reliance on questionable assumption</i> – that giving adolescents what they say they want will promote their mental health. • <i>Reliance on questionable assumption</i> – that more parenting improves family life.	4
4(b)	Having the time available is a necessary condition for engaging in voluntary work (and thereby enhancing the quality of individual and community life), but is not a sufficient condition [1], because, e.g. people may be unwilling to volunteer / they may lack the skills required [1].	2
4(c)	<i>Up to 2 marks for either of the following lines of reasoning:</i> • The main point of the argument is to recommend that governments pay everyone an income sufficient for them to live on at a basic level, but paragraph 4 states that the state cannot afford to pay for many tasks. • The main point of the argument is to recommend that governments pay everyone an income sufficient for them to live on at a basic level, but paragraph 4 states that governments have had to raise the retirement age because they cannot afford to pay pensions to everyone who currently qualifies, which is obviously a much smaller number of people than envisaged under UBI. <i>2 marks for a clear identification of inconsistency with the main point of the argument. 1 mark for adequate identification of inconsistent point in paragraph 4 without clear contrast to the main point of the argument.</i>	2

Question	Answer	Marks								
5	<table><tr><td>Supported conclusion</td><td>1 mark for a precise, supported conclusion that meets the requirement of the question.</td></tr><tr><td>Reasons</td><td>1 mark for each use of a reason supporting a conclusion, up to a maximum of 3.</td></tr><tr><td>Inferential reasoning</td><td>1 mark for each use of an intermediate conclusion, up to a maximum of 3.</td></tr><tr><td>Argument elements</td><td>1 mark for each use of appropriate argument elements (counter with response, example, evidence, analogy, hypothetical reasoning), up to a maximum of 3.</td></tr></table> Maximum 6 marks for wrong conclusion or if conclusion is implied but not stated. 0 marks for answer unrelated to the claim given. No credit for material merely reproduced from the passage. Annotate answers as follows: C To indicate main conclusion. I To indicate creditworthy intermediate conclusion. R To indicate creditworthy reason used to support a conclusion. AE To indicate creditworthy appropriate argument element. Example 8-mark answers <i>Support (126 words)</i> Both the ability and the need to work are aspects of human nature. Research into the causes of mental illness has shown that being too ill to work or unable to find a job are frequent causes of depression. By contrast, success in work produces the sense of self-worth which everyone needs. So, working benefits individuals personally. A certain amount of work needs to be done in order to produce the goods (such as food and clothing) and perform the services which society needs. Everyone benefits from these goods and services. It is therefore unfair if some people who are capable of bearing their share of these responsibilities choose not to do so. Therefore, everyone who is capable of working for their living should do so.	Supported conclusion	1 mark for a precise, supported conclusion that meets the requirement of the question.	Reasons	1 mark for each use of a reason supporting a conclusion, up to a maximum of 3.	Inferential reasoning	1 mark for each use of an intermediate conclusion, up to a maximum of 3.	Argument elements	1 mark for each use of appropriate argument elements (counter with response, example, evidence, analogy, hypothetical reasoning), up to a maximum of 3.	8
Supported conclusion	1 mark for a precise, supported conclusion that meets the requirement of the question.									
Reasons	1 mark for each use of a reason supporting a conclusion, up to a maximum of 3.									
Inferential reasoning	1 mark for each use of an intermediate conclusion, up to a maximum of 3.									
Argument elements	1 mark for each use of appropriate argument elements (counter with response, example, evidence, analogy, hypothetical reasoning), up to a maximum of 3.									

Question	Answer	Marks
5	<i>Challenge (131 words)</i> Although it is true that the ability to work is an important aspect of human nature, work is a broader category than covered by the phrase ‘working for their living’. Some of the most important kinds of work, such as child care and home-making, are done within the context of family life, rather than for an employer. So expecting everyone to undertake paid work undervalues some very valuable activities. Some people remain quite capable of earning their living long after they have passed retirement age. However, they should not feel under any obligation to continue paid work, because they have already made their contribution to the common good and should now feel free to enjoy their leisure. Therefore, not everyone who is capable of working for their living should do so.	